

MINUTES

Special Called Meeting of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon
October 1, 2016

CALL TO ORDER

The Presbytery of Grand Canyon of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) held a special Called Meeting at Memorial Presbyterian Church in Phoenix. Ken Page, Moderator, opened the meeting at 10:00 a.m. with the lighting of the Peace Candle and prayer. Commissioners attending for the first time and other guests were welcomed. Bob Schulz, Stated Clerk, reported that a quorum was present, consisting of at least 15 teaching elders and 15 ruling elders with at least 15 churches being represented.

This special meeting was duly called by the Leadership Team under the provisions of the Presbytery's Manual of Administrative Operations, Part 17, for the purpose of considering the Terms of Dismissal for those churches seeking dismissal from the PC(USA) which had reached an agreement with their respective Administrative Commission. The proposed settlement agreements had been posted to the Presbytery's website for review by commissioners prior to the meeting.

ROLL

Teaching Elders Present – 53

Baer, Doug	Hawkins, Darren	Parker, Thomas	Simmons, Robert
Beard, Steve	Hicks, David	Poling, John	Spence, Edward
Brown, Kelsy	Hicks, Mae	Pulido, Gloria	Tilly, Mark
Byall, Lowell	Jennison, Cynthia	Proudfoot, Charles	Uhley, James
Bybee, David	Johnson, Bruce	Ramos, Gonzalo	Watkins, Gale
Coffman, Renee	Ledermann, Eric	Rice, Kristen	Wellington, Judy
Evans, Jonathan	Letizia, Gordon	Sadongei, Martha	Winkpleck, Judy
Evans, Lloyd	Lineweaver, Thomas	Saylor, George	Witte, Cathy
Fletcher, Tully	Muenich, Karen	Saylor, Mary	Wood, Patricia Cockrell
Fraser, Jennifer	Munroe, Brad	Seller, Ben	Worsnop, Linda
Freitas, Eneyas	Murman, Kimberly	Selestewa, Sharon	Zabriskie, Richard
Gephart, Al	Northrup, Cathy	Serchak, David	
Good, Bill	Page, Kenneth	Serchak, Jo	
Hartwell, Michael	Palmer, Theron	Sexton, Kirk	

Churches/Ruling Elder Commissioners Present – 39

Bethany - Kathryn Owens	Mingus View - Susan Goe
Celebration of Life - Elly Schemen	Mission del Sol - Owen Clymer
Chinle Trinity - Rayme Walker	Mountain View - David Sanderson
Christ - Carolyn Weest	Northminster - Tim Kester
Crosswinds - Teri Conrad	Orangewood - Keith Wetzel
Desert Palms - Jane Linville, Kay Kernek	Palo Cristi - Pat O'Grady
Faith - Beverly Fletcher	Payson Community - John Wilson
Fountain Hills - John Bivens	Pinnacle - Jeff Smith
Fort McDowell - Tom Jones	Prescott Trinity - Dede Tilly
Gila Crossing - Anthony Hill	Salt River - LaBerta Collins
Guadalupe - Jimmy Molina	Scottsdale - Elizabeth McKinnon, Jay Hinds
Heritage - Jerry Muenich	Sierra Vista - Glen Moss
Horizon - Chuck Jarrell	Southminster - Doris Lewis
Lake Havasu Community - John Masden	University - Lawn Griffiths, Molly Winkler
Lehi - Eugene Chiago	Valley - Bob Aldag
Memorial - Ted Keane	Westminster - Don Merritt, Marcia Weiland
Mesa First - Bill Lents	Wickenburg First - Ruth Callahan, Joyce Shaw

Commissioned Ruling Elders Present – 0

Ruling Elder Leadership Team Members Present – 3

George Prohaska Bob Schulz Mary Lynn Walters

Staff Members Present

Beth Kath Carolyn McBurney

Registered Visitors Present – 38

Teaching Elders Excused

Anderson, Fred	Farwell, Barbara	Lefebvre, Eugene	Sabbagh, John
Arbesman, Janet	Flahiff, John	Martz, Robert	Schenck, Jed
Bailey, Linda	Fooks, John	Mayes, Robert	Schmitt, Gus
Baxter, Patricia	Forsberg, David	McCabe, Norma	Simms, Lowelle
Beghin, Emily	Fowler, Douglas	Melendez, Hipolito	Smith, Esther
Berg, George	Fox, Charles	Meredith, Ralph	Soderquist, Paul
Bigler, Robert	Fulton, Helmi	Merwald, Alfred	Straatmeyer, Al
Brahams, Hap	Gray, Barrie	Miller, Craig	Swicegood, Terry
Bruening, James	Hayes, William	Miller, Jerry	Ulrickson, Paul
Burtless, Stanford	Hodgson, Deanne	Moe, Kenneth	Valle, Paula
Cameron, Stu	Hodgson, David	Moe, Michelle	Vautier, Grif
Campbell, Arthur	Houdeshell, Donovan	Moranville, Thomas	Vogel, Leslie
Citron, Suzanne	Jacobs, Lynn	Moser, Paul	Voth, John
Clark, Bobbye	Joe, Victor	Nielsen, Richard	Walker, David
Clark, Robert	Johnson, Caleb	Nieto, Michael	Wallace , David
Cook, John	Mann, Melissa	Nieto, Kelly	Wescott, Linda
Corazin, Nan Lyn	Jousan, Mike	Olagues, José	White, Frank
Davis, Harrell	Keesecker, Joe	Oppenhuizen, Kathleen	Witt, Bill
Day, Kathleen	Kesler, Jim	Parker, Gayle	Wright, Douglas
Doh, Helen	Kim, Kwang	Pfeffer, William	Wright, Eugene
Doh, Joseph	Kim, Myung Bae	Phillips, Norman	Young, Alvin
Dulaney, Robert	Kirk, Wayne	Phillips, Beverly	Young, Patricia
Eckert, Peter	Kush, Gary	Pratt, Edward	Zelle, Trina
Engstrom, Bud	Latty, Allan	Ramsdell, Richard	

Churches/Ruling Elder Commissioners Excused

Fort Defiance Kayenta Vah Ki Yarnell

Teaching Elders Absent

Albertson, Daniel	Garcia, Joaquin	Lloyd, Linda	Turner, David
Anderson, Mark	Goad, Jessica	Miller, Joan	Vautier, Holly
Avram, Wesley	Harmon, Frank	Moorefield, Susan	Weir, Kyle
Berry, Thomas	Hart, Floyd	Ramirez, Julio	Wilcher, Jay
Blincoe, Robert	Hilla, Andrew	Roberts, Margaret	Wintz, Michael
Brandfuss, Gwen	Holland, Cheri	Schumacher, Bruce	Wintz, Susan
Cho, Yongho	Japenga, Mike	Schultz, Harris	Woodruff, Kelsey
Eaken, Lawrence	Joynt, David	Song, Seok Min	
Felix, Robert	Khjeek, Estawri	Stahmer, Bruce	
Fisher, Scott	Kerber, Keith	Tamayo, Erin	

Commissioned Ruling Elders Absent

Danny Halwood	Paul Jones	Annette Lewis	Sam Weinschenk
Lois Hildenbrand	Calvin Kelly	Martha Lopez Loredó	

Churches Absent

Arizona Korean	Flagstaff Federated	Parker Valley	Tuba City
Betania	Gila Crossing	Peoria First	Urban Connect
Central	John Calvin	Pinetop Community	Wellton Community
Church of the Master	Leupp First	Sacaton First	Yuma First
Emmanuel	Maricopa First	Sun City First	

AGENDA

Presbytery approved the agenda:

10:00 a.m.	Call to Order, Lighting of Peace Candle and Opening Prayer	Ken Page
10:05 a.m.	Welcoming First Time Commissioners, Teaching Elders, Guests	Ken Page
	Enrolling Corresponding Members	
	Establishing a Quorum	
	Approving the Docket	
	Approving the Rules of Decorum and Debate	
	Greeting	Cynthia Jennison
	Sharing the Peace of Christ	
10:25 a.m.	Review of Gracious Dismissal Policy	Ken Page
10:30 a.m.	Christ Goodyear Administrative Commission Report	Ed Spence
11:00 a.m.	Horizon Administrative Commission Report	Ed Spence
11:30 a.m.	Community Lake Havasu Administrative Commission Report	Robert Orf
12:00 p.m.	First Wickenburg Administrative Commission Report	Robert Orf
12:30 p.m.	Fountain Hills Administrative Commission Report	George Prohaska
1:00 p.m.	Remaining Steps in the Dismissal Process	Bob Schulz
1:05 p.m.	Adjourn with Prayer for Departing Churches, Pastors and Congregations	Ken Page

RULES FOR DECORUM AND DEBATE

Presbytery approved the Rules for Decorum and Debate as distributed at the meeting:

MOTION: To adopt the following Rules of Decorum and Debate and Procedures for Voting on Proposed Motions for Dismissal.

**RULES OF DECORUM AND DEBATE AND PROCEDURES FOR VOTING
ON PROPOSED MOTIONS FOR DISMISSAL
October 1, 2016**

BACKGROUND ON GRACIOUS DISMISSAL POLICY

At the Presbytery meeting held on March 7, 2015, a motion was presented to replace Part 17 of the Manual of Administrative Operations dealing with “Presbytery Policy for Congregations Desiring a Departure from the PC (USA).” The document submitted for consideration at the March meeting had components that did not meet the test of being constitutional as established by recent Permanent Judicial Commission decisions as communicated by the General Assembly office of Constitutional Services.

A Gracious Dismissal Policy document was prepared for consideration at the November 7, 2015 Presbytery meeting, in accord with actions taken at the March 7, 2015 Presbytery meeting. The Gracious Dismissal Policy was approved by the Presbytery.

It is with this Gracious Dismissal Policy that the churches have come before the Presbytery of Grand Canyon seeking dismissal from the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.).

RULES OF DECORUM AND DEBATE

1. Speeches to any of the motions are limited to 2 minutes by those eligible to vote, alternating pro and con. There will be a microphone and those wishing to speak will line up behind the microphone and will be recognized on an alternating basis between pro and con. Discussion is limited to proposed Dismissal Terms contained in the Administrative Commission Report. The Stated Clerk will maintain a timer.
2. Each person may speak twice on a subject and may not speak a second time until everyone who wishes has spoken.
3. State your name and church affiliation before making comment.
4. Remarks shall be confined to the pending question/issue/amendment and remarks shall not impugn another person or that person's motives.
5. All remarks shall be addressed to the moderator.
6. Persons' names should not be used, except by way of introduction of yourself when addressing the assembly.
7. Remarks may not refer adversely to prior acts or discussion.
8. Extra reports or documents, other than the report of the AC proposal/report, are not to be read or distributed.
9. Persons shall not disturb the assembly, e.g. clapping, shouting, etc.
10. Moderator shall monitor and preserve decorum during the debate.

PROCEDURES FOR VOTING (approved by the Agenda Planning Committee)

1. Voting on motions for Enrolling Corresponding Members, Approval of the Docket, and Approval of the Rules of Decorum will be by simple majority.
2. Voting on the motions for dismissal shall be done one at a time.
3. Voting is by registered commissioners only.
4. Each commissioner will receive a colored card at time of registration. Only individuals holding the colored card will be counted in the voting process.
5. Each church dismissal vote shall have a minimum of 2/3 of the total votes cast for approval.
6. Votes shall be counted by counters selected from the commissioners by the Stated Clerk.

Counters selected by the Stated Clerk were: Bill Lents, Jeannette Miller, Bruce Porter and Laurie Porter.

It was noted that the Gracious Dismissal Policy specified that voting on a church dismissal was to be by written ballot. In addition to the colored card received at registration, each Teaching and Ruling Elder commissioner entitled to vote was then given four additional cards with which to vote.

GREETING

The Rev. Cynthia Jennison, Interim Pastor, welcomed Presbytery to Memorial Presbyterian Church. Presbyters were invited to share the Peace of Christ with one another.

REVIEW OF GRACIOUS DISMISSAL POLICY

Ken Page provided a brief review of the basic provisions of the Presbytery's Gracious Dismissal Policy as found in the Manual of Administrative Operations, Part 17 (pp. 31-38). He pointed out that the procedure outlined in the policy was designed to be charitable and leave a viable congregation at the departing church while still being responsible to the long term interests of the Presbytery.

FURTHER STEPS IN THE DISMISSAL PROCESS

Bob Schulz said that any new terms requested at this meeting regarding a settlement agreement would have to be referred back to the respective Session and Administrative Commission for consideration, with the vote on the dismissal to be rescheduled for the spring of 2017 or later.

He explained that each agreement approved by Presbytery at this meeting would allow that dismissal process to go forward. Details would be written up as a legal document by a title company for closing on the property, with Bob to sign on behalf of the Presbytery and the church to assign a representative to sign on behalf of the congregation. After closing, Bob would write a letter to the church's new denomination, along with a letter for the pastor, and only then would the dismissal be official.

Bob was asked about those members at any of the departing churches who might not want to leave the PC(USA). He explained that these people would become members under care of the Presbytery for a time while they were encouraged to find a new church home.

CHRIST PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH ADMINISTRATIVE COMMISSION REPORT

TE Ed Spence, Moderator of the Administrative Commission, introduced the other Commission members (who also served as the AC for Horizon): TE James Crelin, RE Susan Goe, CRE Martha Lopez Loredo, RE Jeannette Miller, TE Martha Sadongei and CRE Hilbert Schouten.

Ed explained that the Commission had determined that an overwhelming majority of the congregation was in favor of departure from the PC(USA). He added that the terms of dismissal took into account the significant debt of the church. The following motion was proposed by Stated Clerk Bob Schulz:

MOTION: That Christ Presbyterian Church in Goodyear, Arizona, shall be dismissed to the following Reformed body, A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians, with the financial arrangements and other provisions listed as a part of the Report of the Administrative Commission (see pp. 9-12).

Bob Simmons, Senior Pastor at Christ Presbyterian, told the Presbytery that the dismissal process had, indeed, been gracious and he thanked the members of the Administrative Commission. He reported that their Session had called for a season of discernment due to actions of the General Assembly that were considered so objectionable that over half of the congregation threatened to leave if the church did not seek dismissal from the PC(USA).

When the floor was opened for discussion, several Teaching Elder members of Presbytery expressed their sadness about the dismissals being considered at this meeting and the corresponding departure of fellow Teaching Elders with whom they had shared a long history of ministry, both within Grand Canyon and the greater denomination.

There being no further discussion, the motion for dismissal was approved by the Presbytery by a written ballot resulting in 87 for and 7 against, with 1 abstention.

HORIZON PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH ADMINISTRATIVE COMMISSION REPORT

Ed Spence, Moderator of the Commission (with the same members as the AC for Christ Goodyear), reported that they had doubts about the financial health of the congregation because it had experienced significant loss of membership over the past few years as departure from the PC(USA) was contemplated. He explained that due to this the proposed financial settlement was as lenient as possible, took into account the church's debt load and recent departure of their pastor, and was contingent upon their securing funding to replace their PILP loan within 90 days of October 1, 2016.

The following motion was proposed by Stated Clerk Bob Schulz:

MOTION: That Horizon Presbyterian Church in Phoenix, Arizona, shall be dismissed to the following Reformed body, A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians, with the financial arrangements and other provisions listed as a part of the Report of the Administrative Commission (see pp. 13-15).

Horizon Session member Chuck Jarrell reported on behalf of the church that they had found the dismissal process to be gracious. He expressed appreciation for the Administrative Commission's work with the Session.

The floor was opened for discussion. A Teaching Elder from another Grand Canyon church where some Horizon members had transferred commented that he had been told they felt that they had been "forced" to leave. Chuck Jarrell, responding on behalf of Horizon, said this was not representative of Horizon's response to members who had left the church. There was a question from the floor about the validity of the membership numbers presented in the Administrative Commission's report, to which Ed Spence replied that the Commission had to accept the information supplied to them by the Session.

There being no further discussion, the motion for dismissal was approved by the Presbytery by a written ballot resulting in 78 for and 16 against, with 1 abstention.

COMMUNITY LAKE HAVASU ADMINISTRATIVE COMMISSION REPORT

RE Robert Orf, Moderator of the Administrative Commission, introduced the other Commission members (who also served as the AC for First Wickenburg): TE Kelsy Brown, TE Gordon Letizia, RE Kathryn Owens, TE Terry Palmer, RE Paul Rooker and RE Gloria Young.

David Bybee, Pastor at Community Presbyterian Church, thanked the Commission for their work. He commented that it was not easy for him to leave the denomination to which he had been ordained thirty years prior.

The following motion was proposed by Stated Clerk Bob Schulz:

MOTION: That Community Presbyterian Church in Lake Havasu City, Arizona, shall be dismissed to the following Reformed body, A Covenant Order of Evangelical

Presbyterians, with the financial arrangements and other provisions listed as a part of the Report of the Administrative Commission (see pp. 16-18).

There was a question as to whether winter visitors had been included in the decision to request dismissal from the PC(USA), and it was confirmed that a written survey sent by the Commission to all church members had indicated that over ninety percent were in favor of the dismissal to ECO. There was another inquiry as to if the church had any outstanding PC(USA) mortgage grants and it was confirmed that it did not. It was also noted that Community had always maintained its per capita payments even though the church had been dissatisfied with the actions of the General Assembly for a number of years.

There being no further discussion, the motion for dismissal was approved by the Presbytery by a written ballot resulting in 90 for and 5 against.

FIRST WICKENBURG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMISSION REPORT

TE Terry Palmer, a member of the Commission (with the same members as the AC for Community Lake Havasu), confirmed that their discernment process with the church had indicated that ninety-five percent of the congregation desired dismissal from the PC(USA). It was explained that because the terms of dismissal included payments over a number of years the Leadership Team would be appointing a special three-person Administrative Commission to monitor those payments.

The following motion was proposed by Stated Clerk Bob Schulz:

MOTION: That First Presbyterian Church in Wickenburg, Arizona, shall be dismissed to the following Reformed body, A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians, with the financial arrangements and other provisions listed as a part of the Report of the Administrative Commission (see pp. 19-22).

Jonathan Evans, Pastor at First Wickenburg, echoed comments from the other churches about their process with the Administrative Commission being a gracious experience.

There being no further discussion, the motion for dismissal was approved by the Presbytery by a written ballot resulting in 91 for and 4 against.

FOUNTAIN HILLS ADMINISTRATIVE COMMISSION REPORT

RE George Prohaska, Moderator of the Commission, introduced the other Commission members: RE Mary Danforth, RE Lawn Griffiths, RE Cecil Patterson and TE John Poling.

George explained that during the discernment process the Commission had heard from a substantial majority of the active members. Responses at twelve small group meetings, as well as to a written survey, resulted in sixty-two percent in favor of dismissal from the PC(USA), twenty-one percent not in favor and eighteen percent undecided. The AC had found that most members expressed love for their church family and a desire to keep that family together. Because of this the Commission had determined that even those not desiring dismissal would most likely remain with the church regardless of denominational affiliation, indicating there would be no viable remnant to continue as a PC(USA) congregation.

Bill Good, Pastor at Fountain Hills, reported that he considered the financial agreement proposed by the Commission, and agreed to by the Fountain Hills Session, to be unfair. There was a question from the floor as to why the Fountain Hills agreement included funding for Native American mission support when the other agreements did not. The response from one of the Commission members was that the overall terms of the agreement reflected negotiations that had taken place in light of the fact that such a large portion of the congregation did not desire departure.

The following motion was proposed by Stated Clerk Bob Schulz:

MOTION: That Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church in Fountain Hills, Arizona, shall be dismissed to the following Reformed body, A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians, with the financial arrangements and other provisions listed as a part of the Report of the Administrative Commission (see pp. 23-25).

There was a proposed amendment to the motion which would have removed Items 5b and 5c from the Proposed Dismissal Terms (see p. 25). There was a call for the question and the motion to amend was defeated.

There was a call to return to the main motion and the motion for dismissal was approved by the Presbytery by a written ballot resulting in 84 for and 11 against.

REMAINING STEPS IN THE DISMISSAL PROCESS

Bob Schulz explained that the five dismissal agreements would be turned over to a title company to handle the necessary legal paperwork. He estimated that the time required to handle all five settlements would take approximately 30-45 days. Bob reported that the term for any members from these five churches serving on Presbytery committees or commissions would end December 31, 2016.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Memorial congregation was thanked for its hospitality. The motion was made to adjourn and the meeting was closed in prayer at 12:50 p.m. The next Stated Meeting of Presbytery was scheduled for November 19, 2016, at Faith Presbyterian Church in Sun City.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Presbytery Leadership Team, acting on its delegated authority, approved the Minutes of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon Stated Meeting of October 1, 2016 at the Leadership Team meeting on January 4, 2017.

S/Robert Schulz
Robert Schulz, Stated Clerk/Associate

January 4, 2017
Date

**Proposal for Christ Presbyterian Church Settlement
Christ Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission – Presbytery of Grand Canyon
August 10, 2016**

Background/History

The history of this congregation goes back to the early days of the development of the City of Maryvale in the late 1950's. The Presbytery of Phoenix took steps to organize a new church in that region and purchased land at Indian School Road and 64th Avenue with the hopes of someday having a Presbyterian church there. That hope came to fruition on January 19, 1958 when Christ Presbyterian Church was chartered with 84 members, under the leadership of the Rev. Leonard Boyd. The first unit of the new church was completed in 1959 and the church continued to grow. However, in 1961 the pastor announced that he was leaving. The church doubled down to get through that time and call a new pastor and continued to grow through the 1960's, which included another addition to the church building including a sanctuary. The lot was purchased for \$11,300; there is no record of loans at that time.

In 1970, the Rev. Mike Moxness was called as pastor which led to a long, twenty-year pastorate during which time the church continued to grow and expand its ministry. The Rev. Richard Carus was called as Associate Pastor and, through the combined efforts of all involved, a vibrant, flourishing ministry developed. Two young men from the church entered the ministry; one is Michael Hartwell, pastor at Crossroads Presbyterian Church in Phoenix at this time. The music ministry grew rapidly during this era as well, including a large youth choir, praise band and other programs, with the church growing to a membership of 804.

Following Rev. Moxness' move to a new church in 1990, the church went through a more challenging and difficult time in the 1990's. A new pastor was called, the Rev. Gary Webster, but the church was challenged by new issues in the community, changes in demographics, and older members leaving the church to retire elsewhere. The pastoral leadership was not sufficient to lead the church at a critical time and an Administrative Review committee from the Presbytery of Grand Canyon was brought in to help work with the church and get it moving forward. The church asked the Presbytery to forgive \$17,008 of per capita for three previous years, which was granted, and the Presbytery also approved an additional \$30,000 grant for Christ Church as they worked to secure a new pastor following the resignation of Rev. Webster. The church continued through a challenging time for the next four years as several interim pastors helped to keep the church moving forward. During that time, the remnant of the failed West Valley New Church Development moved to join with Christ Church, bringing 22 new people and \$90,000 to Christ Church. This action helped to provide a needed shot in the arm for the church and its leaders, allowing them to call the Rev. Robert Simmons as pastor in November 2001.

This began a new, refreshing time for Christ Church. Under the leadership of Pastor Bob, the congregation began a season of action and development. The church decided to enter the Redevelopment programs of the PC(USA) and, in doing so, decided on a plan that eventually would move the church to a new site where the church is now on Sarival Avenue. The church worked hard to develop the congregation at a new location in the West Valley while looking for the necessary land for a new church. At the same time, they worked on the plan to sell their former building and put the proceeds toward the new facility. The church was sold to the Arizona Korean Presbyterian Church for \$1.2 million and Christ Church became nomads, worshipping in a Baptist church and then in a Masonic Lodge Hall in Avondale until the first phase building was completed in 2007. An education building was completed in 2012. The congregation has grown to be a diverse, multi-cultural family of 450 members, with a wide variety of programs and mission outreach programs.

Discernment

In more recent years, especially since about 2010, the Session and members have become more concerned about the theological positions of the PC(USA) and have worked to gain greater understanding of those views and how they fit with those held at Christ Church. Members have been concerned enough that 30-40 members streamed the GA meetings of 2012 and 2014. During this time, at least 20 members left because they felt the Session was not moving fast enough to deal with the issues. In early 2015, the church entered a more defined season of discernment by having two pastors from different theological viewpoints come and make presentations about a number of theological issues in the church. These presentations were followed by town hall meetings of the congregation, and a straw poll of the congregation indicated 94% of the congregation agreed with the decision to seek dismissal from the PC(USA). At least 8-10 people have left the church because they disagree with the decision to leave, with an additional 15-20 people staying even though they do not want to leave the PC(USA).

During this time, the Presbytery of Grand Canyon was not involved in the church's discernment process. Because of this missing element of the process, the Administrative Commission was obligated to conduct new meetings with members of the church to determine their perspective on the church's process, to ascertain their desire to remain in the PC(USA) or not, and to be clear about the direction of the church. The AC first met with the Session and Pastor, both individually and together. They highlighted the process mentioned above and gave us a full view of the issues concerning their desire to depart:

- Failure of the church to specify the Essential Tenets of our faith.
- The redefinition of marriage and the Authoritative Interpretation to allow same-sex marriage ceremonies in PC(USA).
- Vagueness about the authority of Scripture and its importance in our theology.
- Issues related to the divinity of Christ and to the GA refusal to acknowledge the "singular saving Lordship of Jesus Christ."
- GA decisions to replace the Fidelity and Chastity language of the *Book of Order* to allow "scruples" and in effect create "local option."
- The issue of being fearful that in the event of the pastor's departure/retirement they would not be able to find a pastor that fit the evangelical position of their congregation under the PC(USA) system.

The Administrative Commission conducted 11 small group meetings with members of the church, at which time many of the above issues were repeated. Members also expressed concern about the church being allowed to keep its property, especially due to the significant debt they have from building the new education building. Their current indebtedness is \$2.3 million dollars. All in all, with the meetings and a large number of surveys returned to us, we heard from over 194 members of the church concerning their dismissal. From those, we learned that 186 want to leave and 8 want to stay or are undecided.

Issues for Consideration

1. As noted in the history above, Christ Church has been well supported by the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), beginning with the purchase of their first property which was later developed and sold for the church's relocation to its present site.
2. The church received an early loan in 1977 from GA for \$18,000 and received a loan from the Claude Morton fund in 2000 of \$50,000 to help with their transition time so they could do some needed renovation of their building. Both loans were paid in full by Christ Church.
3. In the 1990's, during the ministry of Rev. Gary Webster, the church asked the Presbytery to forgive \$17,008 of per capita for three previous years, which was granted. The Presbytery also approved an additional \$30,000 grant for Christ Church as they worked to secure a new pastor following the resignation of Rev. Webster during what was a very lean time for the church.

4. Christ Church is concerned that the Presbytery may have profited from the sale of their former property which was purchased by Arizona Korean Church and later sold. Arizona Korean paid \$1.2 million for the property and, when they could not maintain the campus at 67th and Indian School, sold that building for the same price. With the proceeds, they pay off a debt to Presbyterian Investment and Loan Program (PILP) and the balance was used to purchase a new, smaller site in Sun City. In the end, no funds came to the Presbytery for the original Christ Church property.
5. Outside of the initial outlay of \$1.2 million from the sale of the property on 64th and Indian School in 2004 Christ Church has received no additional funding by way of grants, loans, PILP loans, etc. The second addition of a fellowship hall and education building was funded exclusively with offerings and gifts of the members of Christ Presbyterian Church.
6. It is our responsibility to obtain an appraisal of the property, which was provided by Valbridge Property Advisors. After a thorough analysis of the property and the region in relation to church property, it was valued at \$3,275,000.
7. Because there is a significant mortgage on the property, we agree with the Transition Team from Christ Presbyterian Church that it is fair to consider the equity value of the property when determining the settlement amount. The following calculation is used to satisfy the Trust Clause of the PC(USA). The Market Appraisal (\$3,275,000) is made up of 68% debt (\$2,231,520) and 32% estimated equity (\$1,043,480).
8. Christ Presbyterian has surplus cash funds of \$479,119 received from Trivium School rental proceeds, which ended at the start of the 2015 school year. Those funds are earmarked for the following:
 - a. Using a portion of these funds to offset Christ Church's deficit (\$112,495) tithing budget for 2016.
 - b. CPC has entered into an 8-10 year mission sponsorship project with Las Aguas, Haiti. The mission work resulting from this ministry will provide a stable infrastructure for this village (clean water access, sanitation, education, agriculture, and health services).
 - c. The remaining funds, will contribute to the maintenance of CPC's campus facilities to ensure the safety of members and guests.
9. During the past four years (2012-2015) the church has maintained payments for per capita but has not participated in the Presbyterian Mission Fund. During this time Christ Church has committed to a number of mission projects in place of support of the PMF – including critical support for The Spring (a former PC(USA) fellowship), as well as support of mission work closely affiliated with Christ's church membership. Christ Church did participate in some of the PC(USA) special offerings including Christmas Joy, Peacemaking and One Great Hour of Sharing.
10. Christ Presbyterian Church has volunteered to repay the three years of forgiven per capita (\$17,008) and also the \$30,000 grant given to help sustain the church in the 1990's.
11. The Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon and the Trust Clause of the *Book of Order* require that the AC take into account the value of the church's property and also recognize the burden of history which allows the congregation to get to the place where it is now. In this case, we recognize that all congregations emerge and grow from the collective gifts of God's people. These often include the direct gifts of individuals (through their labors or their money), gifts from other congregations (furniture and supplies), and gifts from the Synod and GA. As highlighted above, this church has been richly blessed by the support and connection with the PC(USA) since it was birthed until now.
12. We also affirm that the Pastor and Christ Presbyterian Church desire to leave the PC(USA) and become members of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians).

Proposed Dismissal Terms

In keeping with the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon and in keeping with the charge to our commission, especially item (e) “in consultation with the session, to seek a mutually agreeable proposal for the disposition of all property, contents, and historical documents, with the aim of furthering the mission of Christ through good stewardship of resources,” we propose the following:

1. That Christ Presbyterian Church be dismissed from the PC(USA) and allowed to become a member of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians), when the way is clear.

2. That the church’s pastor, the Rev Robert Simmons, also be allowed to transfer his status as a Teaching Elder to ECO, when the way is clear.

3. That the church will be responsible for the following costs for this process:

\$ 3,000	appraisal cost
\$ 1,000	cost for Commission operations (approx.)
\$ 1,500	cost for copying all of church documents for historical records, to include all records concerning membership, session minutes, lists of officers/pastors, all legal transactions, etc. (approx.)
\$ 1,000	cost for transfer property ownership to Christ Presbyterian Church (approx.)
\$16,116	per capita for 2016
\$ 17,008	per capita reimbursement for 3 forgiven years (1990’s)
\$ 30,000	reimbursement of funds previously given to help call a pastor
<u>\$104,340</u>	value of the PC(USA)’s portion of the property; valuation based on the equity value of the property (10% - a biblical tithe). This may be paid in yearly payments for 5 years in the amount of \$20,868 each year. At Closing, a Deed of Trust will be signed which includes the terms of this agreement and states that if payments are not completed the Presbytery of Grand Canyon has the right to foreclose on the property. Upon payment of these funds, the church’s responsibility to the Presbytery is concluded. These funds are to be placed in the Mission Endowment Fund of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon.
 \$173,964	 Total Settlement Amount

We are grateful for the continued work toward a Gracious Dismissal process. Both the Church and the AC have tried to work together for the future of both the church and the Presbytery. Both parties have appreciated the spirit and effort of all involved.

Additional information: The Commission wishes to note, that while the church asked for an amount equal to 8% of their equity value in the property, the Commission disagreed and felt that a Biblical tithe was more in keeping with the spirit of the Gracious Separation policy.

The Christ Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission

TE Edward Spence, Moderator; TE James Crelin; RE Susan Goe, RE Martha Esther Lopez Loreda; RE Jeanette Miller, TE Martha Sadongei and RE Hilbert Schouten

**Proposal for Horizon Presbyterian Church Settlement
Horizon Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission – Presbytery of Grand Canyon
September 10, 2016**

Background/History

Horizon Presbyterian Church began as a New Church Development on behalf of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon in 1988. At that time the Presbytery purchased the acreage on which the church now stands. The Rev. Kay Brown was called as organizing pastor. During the early years, the church met in office space, a shopping mall area and a school. In 1992 the church was officially chartered with 90 members and they began to make plans for the construction of their first phase building. During the first few years, the Presbytery helped to provide significant support by providing funds for the salary of the pastor until the congregation gained in membership. In 1994 Pastor Brown resigned as pastor and the Rev. Barrie Gray was called as Interim Pastor. Under Pastor Gray's leadership, and with the help of many volunteers, the first phase of the building was completed in time for Easter services in 1996. Since that time the church has been served by Rev. Jim Uhley (1995-2005) and Rev. Ron Hawkins (2007 to Aug. 31, 2016). The church was able to complete a phase 2 classroom building in 1998 which houses God's Garden, a very important children's ministry to the community.

The church has an active ministry outreach which includes a shared relationship with Gila Crossing PC, supporting mission trips to Honduras and Mexico, supporting various food and family ministries in the area, and providing some support for a former PC (USA) New Worshipping Community called The Spring.

In more recent years, the Session and leadership of the church have felt a growing discomfort with the PC(USA) and, in the end, requested a season of discernment with the Presbytery of Grand Canyon in the Fall of 2015. The Administrative Commission has been at work since early 2016 to follow the mandate of the Presbytery to determine the future of our relationship with Horizon Presbyterian Church.

Discernment

- It is noted that the congregation did go through a season of its own discernment without the knowledge or participation of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon in early 2015. These meetings were in town hall settings to share information and in small groups for dialogue about the issues, especially issues raised by actions of the 2014 General Assembly.
- We met first of all with the Session (9 Members) and Pastor Ron Hawkins (who has since moved away), both privately and together. In that gathering we learned that as early as 2010-11, when they began to follow the work of the Fellowship of Presbyterians, the church was beginning to be concerned about the direction of the denomination and their relationship to it. In 2012 the Session began to have more heartfelt conversations about what they believed as a church and the various issues on which they felt the denomination was not in the same place that they were. By the 2014 GA, more issues arose which pressed the Session and pastor to take more active steps to determine whether it was time to leave or not. The church has struggled to decide how to move, which has caused some people to leave due to the slow pace of action or not wanting to deal with conflict about the issues. From the end of 2013 through 2015 the membership dropped from 200 to 124.

The Administrative Commission, having not been part of these conversations and in order to complete our work to determine the true will of the people, set up times for people to come on two different days to meet with Commission members and express their views about the future of Horizon PC and their relationship with PC(USA). During those meetings we met with 43 people, of whom 34 expressed the desire to leave and 9 wanted to remain or were undecided.

Issues raised in the discussions were:

1. The PC (USA) has become too involved in politics, especially decisions related to Israel and divestment from American companies;
2. Issues related to same-sex marriage and the definition of marriage.
3. Feeling that the PC (USA) does not have clear doctrines or beliefs that can be called essential tenets to which all can agree.
4. They feel the PC (USA) has left them, not the other way around.
5. Concerned about not believing in the divinity of Christ – “Christ has been de-throned.”
6. Want to be part of a church that has common goals and beliefs.

Issues for Consideration

- During the church’s 25+ years, there has been considerable support for their ministry, including the purchase of the land (with a net equity of \$130,000), 5 years of support for the organizing pastor’s salary (estimated at \$85,000), a loan from Sunnyslope Presbyterian Church for \$250,000 to get them through a difficult time in 1995; allowed to not have to pay principle on their loan with GA for a period of time so they could support their program; received funds from Synod Claude Morton fund in the amount of \$25,000 in 1995. **Note:** The church has repaid both the Sunnyslope and Claude Morton loans.
- The Commission acknowledges that Horizon PC has, over the years, supported the Presbytery and the PC(USA) with per capita and mission giving. From 1998-2015, Horizon contributed no less than 10% of its operating budget to these causes, totaling \$422,546. Horizon also gave approximately \$10,000 to support the Seminary Education fund in the early 2000’s. Horizon is up to date with regards to per capita, except for 2015, for which \$6,200 is owed, along with \$5,780 for 2016.
- The Presbytery supported the church in its early development, especially at the time when the new pastor needed to step down and the church was about to build their first building. The Presbytery helped to provide a dynamic, creative leader in the person of the Rev. Barrie Gray, who helped them move forward with the building and create a viable mission in preparation for the arrival of a new pastor in 1995. The congregation has been further supported by the Presbyterian Investment and Loan Program in helping them consolidate two previous loans into one account, with a balance yet to be paid of \$660,000 or less by now.
- The Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon and the Trust Clause of the *Book of Order* require that the AC take into account the value of the church’s property and also recognize the burden of history which allowed the congregation to get to the place where it is now. In this case, we recognize that all congregations emerge and grow from the collective gifts of God’s people. These gifts often include the direct gifts of individuals (through their labors or their money), gifts from other congregations (furniture and supplies), and gifts from the Synod and GA. As highlighted above, this church has been richly blessed by the support and connection with the PC(USA) since it was birthed until now.
- The Commission is very concerned about the overall financial health and stability of this congregation due to the recent loss of membership, as noted above; the small number of pledging units (only 33 for 2016); a dependency on plate (loose) offerings to balance a deficit budget (\$17,000 deficit); and the recent loss of their pastor. Historically, interim periods are often not financially stable times for churches. With that in mind, the Commission has considered the equity value of the property, which is not required by the Gracious Dismissal policy. But we feel it is necessary if we are to hope the church can continue.
- It was our responsibility to obtain an appraisal of the property, which was provided by Valbridge Property Advisors. After a thorough analysis of the property and the region in relation to church property, it was valued at \$1,725,000 (\$100/sq. ft.). The equity value of the property is estimated to be \$1,065,000 (\$1,725,000 minus \$660,000 loan).
- We understand that Horizon Presbyterian Church desires to leave the PC(USA) and become a member of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians).

- Their pastor, Ron Hawkins, has resigned to join the staff of an ECO congregation in Texas, so his transfer to ECO has already happened through that call process.

Proposed Dismissal Terms

In keeping with the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon and in keeping with the charge to our Commission, especially item (e): “in consultation with the Session, to seek a mutually agreeable proposal for the disposition of all property, contents, and historical documents, with the aim of furthering the mission of Christ through good stewardship of resources,” we propose the following:

1. That Horizon Presbyterian Church be dismissed from the PC(USA) and allowed to become a member of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians), when the way is clear.

2. That the church will be responsible for the following costs for this process:

\$ 2,750	appraisal cost
\$ 1,000	cost for Commission operations/attorney fees
\$ 1,000	cost for copying all church documents for historical records, to include all records concerning membership records, Session minutes, lists of officers/pastors, all legal transactions, etc. (approx.) *
\$ 1,000	cost for transfer property ownership to Horizon Presbyterian Church (approx.) *
\$ 11,980	per capita for 2015 & 2016
<u>\$106,500</u>	value of the PC(USA)’s portion of the property valuation based on the equity value of the property (10%, a biblical tithe)
\$124,230	Total Settlement Amount

3. We propose that the Presbytery of Grand Canyon take action to approve the above financial terms of dismissal for Horizon Presbyterian Church so that the church can pursue the refinancing of their existing PILP loan and pay off that loan. We ask for a period of 90 days for the church to complete this process. This agreement will not be complete until the loan is approved, all documents are signed, and all fees and costs are paid (\$124,230) and approved by the title company handling the Presbytery’s property issues. At that time of closing, the title to the property will be signed over to Horizon Presbyterian Church.

4. If no such loan is forthcoming, the AC will commence a new proposal for the possible dismissal of Horizon Presbyterian Church to ECO, which could mean dismissal without the property. Should the process stop completely, Horizon would be responsible for the costs incurred by the Commission up to this point (Commission expenses, appraisal of the property, etc.) plus per capita for 2015 and 2016. There would be no costs for copying church records, closing costs or transfer of title, since these would not be needed.

The Horizon Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission

TE Edward Spence, Moderator; TE James Crelin; RE Susan Goe, RE Martha Esther Lopez Loreda; RE Jeanette Miller, TE Martha Sadongei and RE Hilbert Schouten

Proposal for Community Presbyterian Lake Havasu City Church Settlement
Community Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission – Presbytery of Grand Canyon
October 1, 2016

Background/History

Lake Havasu City was founded by Robert P. McCulloch as a planned master community in 1978. The city, officially incorporated in 1978, now has a year around population of over 55,000 people (2015 estimate) and occupies 43 square miles in Mojave County, Arizona.

Community Presbyterian Church was founded in 1967 and was officially incorporated in 1969. The main sanctuary was dedicated that same year on land donated by the McCulloch Corporation. The education/fellowship building was completed in 1974. Most of the stained glass windows in the sanctuary were built and designed by church members and improvements have been made over the years, including a fellowship hall.

According to the current pastor, in recent years Community Presbyterian has identified more with the Presbytery of San Diego than with the Presbytery of Grand Canyon. A move was initiated to switch to the Presbytery of San Diego some years ago, but the request was denied at the General Assembly level due to the fact that it would involve "... a change of Synods within the denomination."

Changes to the *Book of Order* have caused ongoing concern to the congregation. This congregation had experienced upheaval as an earlier pastor abruptly identified as gay, divorced his wife, and moved to Washington State. Rev. Bybee indicated that he was committed to uphold "Amendment B" as a condition of his call. He has been Senior Pastor at CPC for 15 years, and despite the national trend of declining church membership, CPC has continued to maintain membership. After "several years" of prayer and discernment, the Session of CPC in a letter dated October 15, 2015 to Rev. Brad Munroe, Presbytery Pastor of Grand Canyon, formally requested dismissal with the intent to join ECO.

During this period of discernment, the Presbytery of the Grand Canyon was not a party to these deliberations. Various small group discussions were held, ECO materials distributed, and a straw vote of the congregation taken, all leading up to the decision to request dismissal. According to the Session request, the decision was based on the theological drift between the progressive adherents of the PC(USA) and the Bible-based traditional believers. They felt that the PC(USA) has "...left us in many areas where there was agreement in the 1983 merger of the UPC and the PC(USA)." The Session listed the following areas that they believe are not in alignment with the current PC(USA) denomination teachings: the authority of scripture; the Lordship of Jesus Christ; current support of Israel and the Jewish people; Christian ethics; what it means to be Reformed; mission; unity in the Universal Church; sanctity of marriage; and proclamation of the gospel of Jesus Christ. A comparison was drawn up for the congregation showing the differences between the progressive and traditional positions of the Presbyterian Church.

Page one of the current church website (<http://www.havasupresby.org>) states their position very strongly:

WE ARE REMAINING FAITHFUL BY GOD'S GRACE (Luke 19:17)

"In the western world we are seeing a rise in secularism (living our lives apart or void of any Bible based Christian influence.) Many denominations have succumbed to a semi-secular form of Christianity. 'They will act religious, but they will reject the power that could make them godly.' (2 Tim. 3:5) We at Community Presbyterian Church will remain Presbyterian, but 'disassociate in place' with those who blatantly hold these unbiblical positions. We at CPC seek to hold fast to the historic Christian faith. Not limited to the following points, we desire to:

1.) Live under the absolute Lordship of Jesus Christ, Who is the Only means of salvation (Phil.2:9-11; John14:6).

- 2.) Live in loving and holy relationships, honoring marriage between a man and a woman, by ordaining or the participation of only those living in “fidelity in marriage and chastity in singleness.” Knowing full well that there is forgiveness for all; following the words of Jesus “to go and sin no more.” (Exodus 20:14; John 8:1-11)
- 3.) The final authority in all of Christian living is God’s Word, the Bible and being informed by the historic confessions. (2 Timothy 3:14-17; Psalm 119:105)

The Session of Community Presbyterian Church

The Administrative Commission met in Lake Havasu City individually with the staff of Community Presbyterian, the Session, and various members in small groups on May 16 and May 17, 2016. A letter was mailed to the members inviting them to attend small group discussions about the request by the Session to leave the PC(USA). During this initial visit, the Commission heard from church members of their process to arrive at the Session’s request to be dismissed. It was the feeling of the Commission that the majority of those attending these small group meetings favored dismissal from the PC(USA) in order to join ECO. Based upon the Commission’s experience, it was decided to pursue financial considerations of dismissal.

The church has been actively courting ECO for membership, with the application letter sent and a meeting in Lake Havasu scheduled for the last week in September to interview Elders on Session for acceptance into ECO. As of this date (September 16, 2016), ECO has not received an application from Pastor David Bybee to transfer to Teaching Elder status in ECO, but it is the understanding of the Commission that this application is forthcoming.

During these small group meetings, the members expressed a deep sense of congregational community. Activities included Vacation Bible School, AWANA, Thanksgiving and Christmas potluck dinners, Christmas candlelight services and various other programs. Four separate Bible studies are held for members. During holiday seasons, members contributed and filled gift bags for those in need and for shut-ins in the community. CPC has allowed community organizations to use their facilities, including Boy Scouts, Stitchers group, Colomonde Chorus Choir, Alzheimer’s/Dementia Connection, and more. A food pantry program for the community has been put in place on the CPC campus as part of the community outreach. The mission outreach is both local and global: Mariners, the Angel Tree Project, food for children in need, the church pantry, and gospel outreach in many ways. CPC participates with the Global Fellowship Network, which has an ongoing ministry that reaches many areas of the world in earthquake relief, orphan ministry and teaching church planting, with some of the CPC members directly participating. A very active, viable Christian ministry was evident during the small group member meetings, as nearly all participating in these meetings had some involvement in the life of the church.

At the meeting with the Session it was decided to mail a survey to all members, soliciting their views in writing on the request for dismissal from the PC (USA) to determine interest in leaving the PC(USA). Since these meetings were held during the day, and those who had employment constraints were not able to voice their views, a mailed survey was agreed upon. Also, a number of members leave the area during the summer and would like to be included in the dialogue. The survey was mailed to the member list supplied by CPC, with returned results tabulated as follows:

In favor of dismissal to ECO	120	90.9%
Remain with the PC(USA)	3	2.3%
Undecided	<u>9</u>	<u>6.8%</u>
Total of returned surveys (160 mailed)	132	100.0%

After the survey results were tabulated by the Administrative Commission, it was decided to continue the process of discernment by proposing a financial settlement per the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery. During this process, due diligence per the Gracious Dismissal Policy was pursued. An appraisal of the church property was ordered and received, with an appraised amount of \$1,075,000;

financial information was requested and received from Community Presbyterian Church and asset and cash flow evaluated; and the Presbytery supplied information on its participation in the life of this congregation, beginning with the inception of the church in 1967. The Commission then requested and received by email the contact information for the Session member appointed to lead the Session committee charged with responding to the dismissal proposal (John Masden). Several financial dismissal proposals were presented and responses received, with additional information from Community Presbyterian Church provided to the Commission for evaluation. The final financial settlement, as shown below, will allow this Christian community to have a viable, ongoing program (mission work, scholarships, and facility upkeep), while keeping expense consistent with the contributions of their membership. The proposed settlement also recognizes that since the inception of this congregation, they have been faithful in sending per capita and denomination monies as required, even as they entered a several-year period of discernment to remain in the PC(USA).

It is now the recommendation of this Administrative Commission, as appointed by the Presbytery of Grand Canyon, that the Community Presbyterian Church of Lake Havasu City, Arizona be dismissed from the PC(USA) to become a member of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians), when the way is clear. Also, that the pastor of this congregation, Rev. David Bybee, a pastor in good standing with the Presbytery of Grand Canyon, also be allowed to transfer his status as a Teaching Elder to ECO, when the way is clear.

The Commission has satisfied the charge, as outlined in the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery, and has determined: a) the amount of financial support that CPC has received from the Presbytery; b) the amount of financial support that CPC has shared with the Presbytery; c) the value of the church property, held in trust by the PC(USA); and d) other current assets, liabilities and operating costs that impact the congregation’s ability to continue a viable ministry and mission.

Based upon these considerations, the Commission hereby recommends to the Presbytery that Community Presbyterian Church be responsible for the following expenses as a condition of their dismissal request:

\$ 3,500.00	cost of the property appraisal by Valbridge Property Advisors/MJN Enterprises
\$ 1,278.37	Administrative Commission expenses to date, including cost of mailings to CPC members and worshipping visitors in connection with the request by the Session to be dismissed from the PC(USA)
\$ 750.00	cost of copying records for the Presbytery, Community Presbyterian Church and the PC(USA) as required
\$ 1,000.00	estimated cost of property title transfer to Community Presbyterian Church upon final settlement of dismissal
<u>\$53,471.63</u>	final consideration to the Presbytery of Grand Canyon for property
\$60,000.00	Total Settlement Amount

The total of the above line items is \$60,000.00 and this amount, by agreement, will be submitted to the Presbytery in a one-time payment as a financial condition for dismissal from the PC(USA).

Prayerful consideration has been given to this proposal by both the Administrative Commission and the Session of Community Presbyterian Church, and it has been approved by both parties as a way for this congregation to continue to serve Christ’s mission in their geographical area. Our Commission thanks the Session, and John Masden as appointed spokesperson, for their cooperation in providing the necessary information for us to fulfill our assignment. It is with a degree of sadness that we wish Community Presbyterian Church continued success upon their dismissal from the PC(USA).

The Community Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission

RE Bob Orf, Moderator, TE Kelsy Brown; TE Gordon Letizia; RE Kathryn Owens; TE Terry Palmer; RE Paul Rooker and RE Gloria Young

**Proposal for First Presbyterian Church Wickenburg Settlement
First Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission – Presbytery of Grand Canyon
September 16, 2016**

Background/History

A small group of pioneers met in the schoolhouse on June 12, 1905 to organize the First Presbyterian Church of Wickenburg. There were eight residents who convened with a commission appointed by the Presbytery of Arizona for that purpose. For many months during Arizona's Territorial days, church was held in the schoolhouse, in the dining room of the old hotel (located near present day Center and Kerkes Streets), or in private homes. In approximately 1907, Mr. Farnsworth contributed a portion of his land at the corner of Apache and Jefferson Streets to the church. Eventually, and with the help of almost every man in the community, a small one room frame building was constructed on the site. The building served the congregation as a church for more than a decade. Until about 1920 the first little church experienced alternating periods of upkeep and neglect, but it continued to be used by the Protestant ladies of the town. It is stated in "Forty-Five Years in Highlight, First Presbyterian Church, Wickenburg, Arizona," compiled by R. Wilson Brown in 1950, that "There were many times between 1908 and the beginning of World War II when the going was tough. Although the Board of National Missions contributed toward the upkeep of the church, there were financial reverses."

As if in answer to their prayers, Rev. William Borthwick and his wife, both missionaries to India on furlough in the U.S., appeared in Wickenburg in 1921. Encouraged by the arrival of the Borthwicks and new supportive members, the congregation began to seek methods for improving their neglected church. Some members wanted to enlarge and improve the old building while others felt a new structure was the answer. A representative from the Board of Missions came to Wickenburg to assist in determining the best course of action. After inspecting the old building, he recommended that a new church be constructed.

With this main goal the congregation worked together. Townspeople contributed material and labor, and the new church soon became a reality. Before the Borthwicks departed to return to India, they participated in dedicating the new building. In an effort to attract a minister who would remain in Wickenburg to pastor their church, the congregation began renovating the first church building to use as a manse. Again, with assistance from the community at large, the manse was completed in 1929. At that time the church became known as the Community Presbyterian Church.

In the early 1930's new members arrived to join the congregation. By 1939 membership had reached 125, with many friends of the church attending services on a regular basis. For the first time in its history financial independence was enjoyed. The new building was remodeled to include a steeple and other conveniences and, upon completion, the structure was painted white. Long term members often refer affectionately to "the little white church." The manse was reconverted back to church use to provide space for growing Sunday School classes in 1948. The need for a larger church began to be voiced. Shortly after this, primary grade Sunday School children started collecting pennies for the new church. Between July and December 1948 they dropped a total of \$15.32 into a small bank. Those pennies marked the beginning of the building fund that was eventually used to construct the present First Presbyterian Church at 179 North Adams Street.

When Dr. Charles Poling arrived to serve as pastor in 1951 the larger church was still a dream. In 1952 a building committee was appointed and pledges were received from members and friends for the new structure. The site for the present church was purchased in June 1953, but before construction could begin the area required extensive work. To level the irregular terrain retaining walls were needed on the

southern and eastern boundaries. Members of the congregation were once again called upon to work together toward that goal.

In 1953 the congregation moved on Sunday morning in procession to the beautiful new church building one block north of the “little white church.” This new building was built mainly with volunteers and volunteer finances. It is truly a beautiful edifice dedicated to the glory of God.

Discernment

In 1958 the United Presbyterian Church in the United States of America was formed by a merger of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America and the United Presbyterian Church of North America. So First Presbyterian Church became a United Presbyterian Church. In the early 1970's the church's deeds were given to the Presbytery. Soon thereafter the church began showing dissatisfaction with the General Assembly and wrote letters to the Presbytery and General Assembly about those concerns. With no satisfactory response, many members left the church and started another church in Wickenburg.

On April 9, 1975 the Clerk of Session sent a letter requesting that property titles be conveyed back to First Presbyterian Church. On April 17, 1975 the Presbytery responded to that request. On May 15, 1975 the Presbytery recorded Quit Claim Deeds to First Presbyterian Church for the following lots: Lots 7, 8, 9 & 10, Collins Addition; Lot 24, Block 6, Collins Addition; Lots 26 & 27, Block 6, Collins Addition. (Lot 27 was sold in 1976 - it was the manse and the trend was for pastors to own their own homes). The congregation felt the return of deeds acknowledged understanding of the congregation's frustrations with the General Assembly.

Significant events followed. The “Trust Clause” was adopted in 1981. In June of 1983, the unification of the northern and southern branches of the Presbyterian church formed the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.). In 1984 the church corporation bylaws were updated to comply with PC(USA) guidelines. On August 1, 2000 the church purchased Lot 23, Block 6, Collins addition (Little Brown House), still used by Wickenburg youth today. The deed for this property was returned to the Presbytery on December 12, 2004, satisfying the need to hold deeds to our church.

Several discernment actions followed actions of the General Assembly beginning in 2010. A discernment committee was formed. The Session of the church stopped sending per capita in 2011, while increasing its contributions to Missions, so that giving to God would not be diminished. The Discernment Committee was formally instituted in 2012, with responsibility to educate and inform the congregation where the PC(USA) is as a denomination today. A Statement of Faith was created in 2013 so that members might better understand the church's differences with the PC(USA).

In October, 2015 First Presbyterian Church sent a letter to the Presbytery requesting dismissal to ECO. This letter reflected the congregation's long standing frustrations with the General Assembly decisions which the church felt violated many beliefs of long-held Presbyterian faith and biblical foundations. Up until the October 2015 date the Presbytery was not involved in the discernment process. It was decided to form an Administrative Commission to assist in the discernment decisions and provide guidance and guidelines for the requested dismissal process. The Administrative Commission was formed in January 2016.

The Administrative Commission was obligated to conduct meetings with members of the church to determine their perspective on the church's process, to ascertain their desire to remain in the PC(USA) or not, and to be clear about the direction of the church. The AC first met with the Session and Pastor, both individually and together. The AC highlighted the process needed to give us a full view of the issues concerning their desire to depart.

These issues, as expressed by the participants, are:

- Failure of the church to specify the Essential Tenets of our faith.
- The redefinition of marriage and the Authoritative Interpretation to allow same-sex marriage ceremonies in the PC(USA).
- Vagueness about the authority of Scripture and its importance in our theology.
- Issues related to the divinity of Christ and to the GA refusal to acknowledge the “singular saving Lordship of Jesus Christ.”
- GA decisions to replace the Fidelity and Chastity language of the *Book of Order* to allow “scruples” and in effect create “local option.”

The Administrative Commission conducted three small group meetings with members of the church, at which time many of the above issues were repeated. Members also expressed concern about the church being allowed to keep its property. All in all, with the meetings and the number of surveys returned to us, we heard from 130 members and worshipers of the church concerning dismissal from the PC(USA). From those, we learned that more than 95% of the people want to leave and approximately 10 to 15 people want to stay or are undecided. Some of the surveys returned were from members we had visited with in small groups previously.

Issues for Consideration

- It is our responsibility to obtain an appraisal of the property, which was provided by Valbridge Property Advisors. After a thorough analysis of the property and the region in relation to church property, it was valued at \$475,000. There are some properties held by First Presbyterian Church that were not appraised at the time of this first appraisal. Further investigation added two additional parcels to the evaluation: one parcel, with a 798 sq. ft. structure was initially appraised at approximately \$82,000. Subsequent information received revised this estimate to \$30-50,000, as the structure is in need of much repair. The second parcel is a lot adjacent to the main church property, having an appraised value of approximately \$26,385. The total property appraised value adding these two properties is \$551,385.
- First Presbyterian Church has cash funds of approximately \$10,000. Additionally, there is approximately \$175,000 in the Strategic Reserve Fund. Total assets as of August 24, 2016 are \$216,065.
- During the past five years (2011-2015), as previously noted, the church had stopped its per capita payments to the Presbytery, Synod and General Assembly. The amount of unpaid per capita in Presbytery records is \$22,162.50. Projected per capita for 2016 is \$5,508. The Wickenburg church has participated in mission giving, though not through the Presbytery of Grand Canyon. The 2015 mission giving was in the amount of \$19,486.06. Distribution of those monies or other specific mission giving in the past years is not known at the time of this proposal. During discussions the Administrative Commission agreed to adjust the per capita arrears amount and utilized actual yearly member numbers, reducing this amount to \$18,530 for settlement purposes.
- The Gracious Dismissal Policy of Grand Canyon Presbytery and the Trust Clause of the *Book of Order* require that the AC take into account the value of the church’s property and also recognize the burden of history which allows the congregation to get to the place where it is now. In this case, we recognize that all congregations emerge and grow from the collective gifts of God’s people, and these often include the direct gifts of individuals (through their labors or their money) and gifts from other congregations (furniture and supplies), along with the support of the community of Wickenburg.
- We also affirm that the Pastor and First Presbyterian Church desire to leave the PC(USA) and become members of ECO (A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians).

Proposed Dismissal Terms

In keeping with the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon and in keeping with the charge to our commission, especially item (e) “in consultation with the Session, to seek a mutually agreeable proposal for the disposition of all property, contents, and historical documents, with the aim of furthering the mission of Christ through good stewardship of resources,” we propose the following:

- That First Presbyterian Church of Wickenburg be dismissed from the PC(USA) and allowed to become a member of ECO (a Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians), when the way is clear.
- That the church’s pastor, Rev. Jonathan Evans, also be allowed to transfer his status as a Teaching Elder to ECO, when the way is clear.

• That the church will be responsible for the following costs for this dismissal process:

\$ 3,500.00	appraisal cost from Valbridge Property Advisors/MJN Enterprises, Inc.
\$ 498.24	cost for Commission operations/expenses including mailings to members
\$ 750.00	cost for copying all church documents for historical records, including all records concerning membership records, session minutes, lists of officers/pastors, all legal transactions, as required. First Presbyterian Church has reproduced those records they wish to retain for historical purposes.
\$1,000.00	cost for transferring property ownership to First Presbyterian Church upon final settlement of dismissal
\$18,530.00	per capita reimbursement for period of non-payment, adjusted to reflect actual church membership from the years 2011 (partial) and to include 2016
<u>\$46,500.00</u>	value of the property as adjusted for purposes of Gracious Dismissal settlement. This amount is 8.3% of the revised property valuation.
\$70,778.24	Total Settlement Amount

The total amount of this settlement due from First Presbyterian Church to the Presbytery of the Grand Canyon is \$70,778.24.

This may be paid in yearly payments for 7 years in the amount of not less than \$10,111.18 each year. As a stipulation agreed to by First Presbyterian Church, upon completion of all payments within the guidelines the Presbytery of Grand Canyon will release Deeds of Trust for all property, to be filed at the time of closing. If the total balance of the \$70,778.24 is not paid in full within the seven-year period or if payments are not made in the yearly amount specified, or if First Presbyterian Church leaves the denomination to which they are dismissed with an unpaid balance, the Presbytery will file a Deed In Lieu of Foreclosure on the property to collect the unpaid balance of monies due. The Administrative Commission received a request from the church to possibly sell property to offset unpaid balances of the settlement amount at some time. In the view of the Administrative Commission, discussion on this action is not within the scope of this Commission and should be addressed to the Presbytery at such time as the church requests this consideration.

We are grateful for the sustained work toward a Gracious Dismissal by First Presbyterian Church. We are confident that both the church and the AC have worked together for the future of both the church and the Presbytery. We would like to thank particularly Larry Lake, the appointed Session representative of FPC, for his prompt responses and open communication during this dismissal process.

The Community Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission

RE Bob Orf, Moderator, TE Kelsy Brown; TE Gordon Letizia; RE Kathryn Owens; TE Terry Palmer; RE Paul Rooker and RE Gloria Young

**Proposal for Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church Settlement
Fountain Hills Administrative Commission – Presbytery of Grand Canyon
August 23, 2016**

Background/History

In February 1974 twelve dedicated persons made a commitment to join with the Rev. Glenn Atchinson to establish a new church in Fountain Hills, Arizona. On March 31, 1974 the first service of worship was held at Little John's, a bar/restaurant, with 60 persons in attendance. The fledgling church moved to a 2,500 square foot warehouse space in October 1974. The chartering service was held on Advent Sunday, December 1, 1974.

The church's present five-acre site was purchased from Pratt Properties in June 1978. Groundbreaking for the sanctuary took place on March 20, 1983, and the first worship service in the new sanctuary was on December 18, 1983. The church office and Memorial Tower were completed in 1984.

The growing congregation necessitated increases in church staffing and program spaces. The first Associate Pastor at the Fountain Hills church was installed on October 25, 1987. Construction of the Program Center began in January 1989, with dedication of the space in September of that year. The Columbarium was completed and dedicated in 1990, and the church received a gift that enabled the installation of a carillon system in the Memorial Tower. The Biblical Garden was planted in 1992 and the church added 1/3 acre to the site in 1993. In July 2004 the church completed construction of the Fellowship Center to ensure space for fellowship events, kitchen resources and additional classrooms to serve the needs of active youth, family and adult programming. The congregation worked diligently through a series of concerts to pay down the mortgage.

In the next few years issues developed between the Senior Pastor and some members of the congregation, resulting in loss of some members and the resignation of the Senior Pastor in 2007. An interim pastor served the church until the Rev. William Good was called as Senior Pastor in September of 2010. Under Pastor Good's leadership, the congregation has hired a Christian Formation Director and a Pastoral Associate. The church has also added a second service of worship each Sunday, as well as education programs for children, youth and adults.

Discernment

Concern for the future of the Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church within the PC(USA) escalated in 2014. Congregants began to approach the Session with questions like, "How is our Session going to respond to the actions of the 2014 General Assembly with regard to the authority of scripture?" The Pastor and Session then entered into a time of study and reflection, and initiated a series of meetings with the congregation at large. The Session formally requested to enter into a season of discernment with the Presbytery of Grand Canyon in October 2015, with a goal to seek dismissal from the PC(USA). As the Presbytery had not been party to prior internal discernment study and discussions, the Administrative Commission was obliged to "begin at the beginning" in order to determine the congregation's perspectives on whether the Fountain Hills church should remain within the PC(USA).

The AC conducted 12 meetings with small groups of congregants in March and April of 2016. The AC also conducted a mailed-in survey for members who were not able to attend a small group meeting. Key concerns raised in the small group process included:

- A strong desire for the PC(USA) to specify essential tenets of faith for all members of the PC(USA), and dismay that the PC(USA) has not done so.
- Great concern over the Authoritative Interpretation to allow same-sex marriage in PC(USA) churches in states where same-sex marriage is allowed by civil law.

- Property ownership came up in almost every small group meeting, with significant concern over costs to transfer ownership to the Fountain Hills congregation.

Through the discernment process, the AC heard from 182 members of the Fountain Hills congregation, a substantial majority of the active membership. 62% of respondents favored dismissal from the PC(USA), while 21% wished to remain with the PC(USA) and 18% stated that they were not sure on the question of dismissal. Many of the “not sure” group raised the issue of dismissal costs as at least a contributing factor in their personal decision-making process. Taken at face-value only, the statistics from the small group process are somewhat misleading. The AC found that most members at Fountain Hills expressed a genuine love for their church family and a passionate desire to keep that family together. While 21% of small group participants expressed a desire to remain with the PC(USA), it is highly likely that most, if not all, of these members will remain with the church regardless of denominational affiliation. The AC found no evidence for a viable remnant of the congregation to continue as a PC(USA) church following dismissal of the Fountain Hills congregation.

Items for Consideration

1. The town of Fountain Hills is not a retirement community, like Sun City or Sun Lakes. But, many residents in the town are retired and/or winter visitors. The same holds true for many members of the Fountain Hills church.
2. Like many churches, membership at Fountain Hills has declined in recent years. Presbytery records show that membership of 470 in 2005 decreased to approximately 257 by the end of 2015.
3. The Presbytery of Grand Canyon, Synod of the Southwest, and/or General Assembly have actively supported the Fountain Hills church with loans, grants, and loan guarantees from community financial institutions. Presbytery records show five such transactions from 1978 to 2016, with a total value of \$1,124,000. The Fountain Hills congregation paid most of these items in full; there is currently one active loan with Meridian Bank with an outstanding balance of \$323,437.47 (February 2016 statement).
4. An appraisal of the Fountain Hills church campus by Valbridge Property Advisors valued the property at \$2,100,000.
5. The AC concurred with the Session at Fountain Hills to consider the equity value of the church property when determining the property settlement. Thus the basis for property settlement negotiations was reduced to \$1,776,563.
6. Including 2016, total per capita due to the Presbytery totals \$22,726.
7. The AC affirms that the Pastor and congregation of Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church desire to leave the PC(USA) and become members of the Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians (ECO).

Proposed Dismissal Terms

In keeping with the Gracious Dismissal Policy of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon, and in keeping with the charge to the AC, especially item (e) “in consultation with the session, to seek a mutually agreeable proposal for the disposition of all property, contents, and historical documents, with the aim for furthering the mission of Christ through good stewardship of resources,” the AC proposes the following:

1. That the Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church be dismissed from the PC(USA) and allowed to join A Covenant Order of Evangelical Presbyterians (ECO), when the way is clear.
2. That the Senior Pastor at the Fountain Hills church, Rev. William Good, also be allowed to transfer his pastoral credentials to the ECO, when the way is clear.

3. That the Fountain Hills church will be responsible for the following settlement costs:

\$177,656	a biblical title of the appraised property value, reduced by the outstanding mortgage loan principal
\$ 20,000	mission support for Native American Ministries within the Presbytery of Grand Canyon
\$ 18,750	contribution to Mission Endowment Fund of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon
\$ 22,726	per capita payments, including the amount due for 2016
<u>\$ 8,000</u>	estimated AC expenses, including cost for the property appraisal, records copying, etc., with actual costs at the time of dismissal to be used for the final settlement
\$247,132	Total Settlement Amount.

4. That the Fountain Hills church will pay approximately \$30,726.00 at the time of dismissal to cover per capita and Commission expenses.

5. That the Fountain Hills church will make annual payments to the Presbytery of Grand Canyon in the amount of \$43,281.20 to pay items 3a, 3b and 3c above, at no interest, with the first payment due on August 31, 2017 and the last payment due on August 31, 2021. Annual payments shall include:

- a. \$35,531.20 property settlement
- b. \$ 4,000.00 Native American Ministries
- c. \$ 3,750.00 support of the Mission Endowment Fund

The Presbytery of Grand Canyon will continue to hold title and be on the mortgage until Items a, b, and c above are paid in full.

The Fountain Hills Presbyterian Church Administrative Commission

RE George Prohaska, Moderator; RE Mary Danforth; RE Lawn Griffiths; RE Cecil Patterson and TE John Poling